

CHANNEL ISLANDS NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY
Sanctuary Advisory Council Meeting

FINAL Key Outcomes

Friday, March 15, 2019

Museum of Ventura County, 100 East Main Street, Ventura, CA 93001

These notes were approved by the advisory council on May 17, 2019. This summary will be posted [online](#). Audio recordings available upon request from pike.spector@noaa.gov.

Administrative Business and Announcements

Twenty-two council representatives attended the March meeting representing 16 voting seats (see Appendix). Public attendance included approximately 10 individuals in the morning, and 5 in the afternoon.

Recognizing incoming members

Five recently appointed council members and member alternates were announced and introduced themselves:

- Cliff Rodrigues: Education seat member
- Mary Byrd: Public at large seat alternate
- Greg Sanders: Department of Defense seat alternate
- Morgan Coffey: Tourism seat
- Mark Sandoval: Ventura County (alternate)

November 16, 2018 Draft Key Outcomes

By voice vote, the council unanimously approved the key outcomes documented for the November 16, 2018 meeting. Copies of these documents are available upon request from pike.spector@noaa.gov. They will also be posted on the Sanctuary's website.

Sanctuary Superintendent's Report

Superintendent Chris Mobley began his report by thanking and acknowledging Dr. Lindsay Marks for wrapping up her year-long California Sea Grant fellowship at CINMS. Starting in April Dr. Marks will begin a post doctorate research fellowship with the National Marine Fisheries Service. Mobley then acknowledged former California Sea Grant Fellow and current CINMS resource protection department contractor Jess Morten. He then introduced incoming California Sea Grant Fellow Pike Spector.

Mobley then debriefed the council on the 35-day partial government shutdown [December 2018 – January 2019] and its effect on CINMS operations. Mobley acknowledged that the January 2019 SAC meeting was canceled due to the shutdown, and discussed the disruptions to normal CINMS functions, including setting back the schedule for the management plan. However, Mobley assured the council that the Sanctuary office is now back on track. Further, he announced that the budget allocation should be released before the May SAC meeting, and that there is a potential for a slight increase in this year's budget.

In his report, Mobley mentioned National Geographic's *Drain the Oceans* TV program episode about the California Gold Rush, which was filmed at the Santa Barbara Maritime Museum regarding the wreck of the *Winfield Scott* at Anacapa Island. The film crew also conducted dives on the wreck using the r/v *Shearwater*. He also mentioned the recent Aquarium of the Pacific outreach event, "NOAA Day". A booth supported by Channel Islands Naturalists Corps volunteers represented the sanctuary and park to an estimated 7,000 aquarium visitors. He also mentioned that a Vessel Speed Reduction Program award celebration took place in Long Beach earlier that month (March 2019). Mobley then mentioned two outreach events that included 25 science teachers who participated in a training session at Santa Rosa Island, as well as a group of high school students aboard the r/v *Shearwater* that helped with deep-water sediment traps with a researcher from the University of South Carolina. Mobley concluded his report by mentioning the Mussel Watch Program (NOAA), which, since 1986 has collected tissue samples for contaminants along the coast to form a long-term data set. Mussels were recently collected by collaborators and sanctuary staff on San Miguel, San Nicholas and San Clemente Islands, as well as Coal Oil Point and Carpentaria.

Council Member Brief Announcements

Council members shared news and announcements about recent events unrelated to the meeting agenda. Audio recordings are available upon request from pike.spector@noaa.gov.

Council Secretary Nomination and Election

CINMS Deputy Superintendent for Program Michael Murray presided over the nomination and election for Council Secretary. The current secretary, Dr. Bob Warner (Research seat member) was absent from the meeting but had previously been nominated for a second term. No other council members submitted nominations or objections; Dr. Warner was unanimously reelected as Council Secretary.

Whale Protection

Presentation on Modernizing Citizen Science (presentation slides available upon request to pike.spector@noaa.gov)

Sanctuary Outreach Coordinator Shauna Bingham introduced a group of graduate students from the Bren School for Environmental Science and Management (UC Santa Barbara), who gave a presentation to about their master's thesis project titled, "Seatizen Science". The aim of the Seatizen Science project is to better manage marine mammal observational data from the Spotter Pro and Whale Alert apps used by sanctuary Naturalist Corps volunteers and visitors from the general public. The group outlined the benefits of citizen science data, and the need for a better management system. Further, the group presented the need for the collected data to meet the Ocean Biogeographic Information System (OBIS) international standard for citizen collected data, and the shortcomings of both the Spotter Pro and Whale Alert apps. The Seatizen Science team described their data migration and standardization platform and announced the beta design of an integrative website application that allows users to view marine mammal observational data in a concise and useful fashion. The team concluded with the real-

world applications of marine mammal observational data, and its utility to CINMS, and other governmental and non-governmental organizations. The presentation concluded with questions from the Advisory Council, who provided insightful feedback.

2018 Vessel Speed Reduction (VSR) Program Summary (presentation slides available upon request to pike.spector@noaa.gov)

Current California Sea Grant Resource Protection Fellow Dr. Lindsay Marks provided the advisory council with a summary of the 2018 Vessel Speed Reduction (VSR) program. The purpose of the VSR, as part of the “Protecting Blue Whales and Blue Skies” initiative, is to have shipping companies voluntarily reduce vessel speeds in an effort to lessen the lethality of whale-strikes and reduce the amount of pollutants emitted from commercial shipping vessels. In March 2019 CINMS, in collaboration with air control districts from the San Francisco Bay Area, Santa Barbara County and Ventura County, hosted the annual VSR program award ceremony in Long Beach, California. The VSR program provides incentives to shipping companies who elect to require their vessels to maintain a speed of 10 knots or less in designated shipping channels; the VSR ranks participants in tiers based on the percentage of time individual vessels spent traveling at 10 knots or less. Dr. Marks announced that the number of participating companies in the VSR has nearly doubled since its inception in 2014, bringing the total to 12. Further, she described an increase in the number of participating vessels from 14 in 2014 to 280 in 2018, and an increase in nautical miles traveled at 10 knots or less from ~2700 in 2014 to ~46,000 in 2018. Of the participating companies, four achieved the silver tier (meaning > 25% cooperation) in one or both regions, six achieved the gold tier (> 50%), and two achieved the sapphire tier (> 75%). Dr. Marks concluded with the future of the VSR program, which has secured funding for 2019.

Public Comment Period (#1 of 2)

Giles Pettifore (Port of Hueneme Environmental Manager) noted that three of the six major shipping customers of the Port of Hueneme participated in the Vessel Speed Reduction Program this year, and that he will continue to be an advocate for the program.

Sanctuary Soundscape Program (slides available upon request)

Dr. Lindsey Peavey (CINMS Research Specialist) began her presentation about understanding soundscapes in national marine sanctuaries by describing a lawsuit involving the US Navy’s use of Low Frequency Active Sonar and NOAA’s permitting of that activity. A settlement resulted in Navy funding and NOAA involvement in development of capacity to protect acoustic habitats, including monitoring in national marine sanctuaries. Dr. Peavey defined a soundscape as ambient (physical) sounds, biological sounds, and anthropogenic sounds. This project helped to build a capacity across multiple sanctuaries with a focus on identifying key soundscape habitats, and further understanding the influence humans have on the marine environment. Dr. Peavey summarized the first year of the program; in 2018, 35 international soundscape ecologists met to define the procedures, tools, and goals of the project. Dr. Peavey identified five soundscape listening stations in CINMS, which were deployed in November 2019 and March 2019. Dr. Peavey then outlined the next 2-5 years of project, which entail both data analysis and dissemination of findings to the National Centers for Environmental

Information and an accessible web-based interface. Dr. Peavey went on to summarize preliminary findings from the active listening stations within CINMS, including those deployed by Channel Islands National Park. Special focus is being paid to Santa Barbara Island, which, according to Dr. Peavey, is the least studied area in the sanctuary.

The presentation was followed by questions from the council. Dr. Jonna Engle raised the point that the funding for this project was raised from litigation money, and specifically asked how this research relates to the lawsuit. Dr. Peavey replied that reinvesting the money into research was an agreement reached between the defendants and plaintiffs. Dr. Peavey went on to say that the U.S. Navy was heavily involved in the placement of listening stations across sanctuaries, and that they get a chance to review data before it's made public. Donna Schroeder asked about the use of machine learning to help process soundscape data, to which Dr. Peavey replied that automation methods will help streamline data analysis. LDCR Jason Brand asked if the listening stations can determine between whale pod densities, and/or species, and different types of commercial vessels. Dr. Peavey replied that they cannot determine whale densities, but the data can complement other projects in conjunction with AIS vessel data. She went on to say that data from the listening stations can result in the ability to distinguish large commercial vessels from smaller recreational vessels. Finally, CINMS superintendent Chris Mobley mentioned that the sanctuary soundscape program can also draw on archived data, and has different objectives than that of the Benioff Oceans Initiative.

U.S. Navy Projects

Greg Sanders, Point Mugu Sea Range Sustainability Office, NAVAIR U.S. Navy (U.S. Department of Defense – alternate) gave an update on the U.S. Navy's Sea Range, which overlaps with CINMS. Sanders identified the boundaries of the Sea Range, which maintains control of the airspace above the surface of the water. Sanders also described the Sea Range's assets, which includes both jets and missiles. Sanders stated that ongoing projects within the Sea Range were continuing as they have been in previous years, and that there should be no new impacts to CINMS. Sanders went on to say that scoping was conducted in 2018 to characterize all of the activities on the range; the Environmental Impact Statement is available online and a formal draft should be available in the spring [of 2019]. Sanders then described the Navy's need for new undersea fiber optic cables between San Nicolas Island, Santa Cruz Island, and Point Mugu. He reported that plans for installing a new cable line from San Nicolas Island to Point Mugu are moving forward this fall, but that plans for the cable to Santa Cruz Island, which call for proposed directional drilling to avoid shoreline and shallow water impacts near Prisoner's Harbor, are on hold. Sanders then went on to describe minor disruptions to the black abalone and sea otter monitoring programs, and mentioned that the Navy is considering using unmanned vehicles to replace surveyors. Sanders noted that NavAir, a tenant of the Naval Base of Ventura, has been tasked making sure marine mammals are not present during test missile operations. Sanders noted that these missiles are rarely "live". The Navy is now looking to improve monitoring systems to provide real-time surveys before missile operations are conducted to make sure the range is clear of marine mammals. Sanders concluded by stating that while there may be increases in activity on the Sea Range, this will not impact CINMS.

Sanders' presentation was followed by questions from the advisory council. Donna Schroeder asked about any changes to the viability of the kelp forest monitoring around the islands, specifically San Nicholas Island and the Southern Sea Otter Relocation Program. Sanders stated that the Navy is continuing to fund this project, and that the Navy wants regulatory relief on sea otters by supporting the "Sea Otter Readiness Plan". He did note that that capabilities of the U.S. Geologic Survey and the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service might be changing. Deputy superintendent Michael Murray asked about the extent to which shipping traffic through the range can potentially disrupt planned testing operations on the range. Sanders acknowledged that shipping encroachment on the range can absolutely disrupt operations.

Council Work Topics and Management Plan Pre-Scoping Discussion

2018 year-end CINMS and advisory council recap

California Sea Grant Fellow Dr. Lindsay Marks provided an overview of the council's accomplishments and contributions in 2018. Dr. Marks began the recap by mentioned the council's continuation in 2018 of a small business profile series for the sanctuary advisory council, which began with council member Andrea Mills (Island Packers Education Coordinator) presenting an Islands Packers company profile. Dr. Marks also reminded the council that Truth Aquatics owner, Glen Fritzler, had spoken about the services he provides to bring visitors into the sanctuary to dive. Dr. Marks also acknowledged Condor Express and Stardust Sportfishing for their presentation to the council in 2018, and their contributions to bringing visitors into the sanctuary. Dr. Marks then presented information about the research-related activities and issues in the sanctuary that the council had learned about in 2018, including endangered white abalone surveys and restoration, giant sea bass movement, non-native algae, efforts to predict blue whale distribution, and the sanctuary condition report. Dr. Marks went on to cover resource protection and other initiatives that the council had been involved with, which included the sustainability of the local fishing community, cruise ship visits to northern Channel Islands (Lindblad Expeditions), the vessel speed reduction program, enforcement and incident response, the eFINS mobile enforcement application, and shore based radar systems. Council actions in 2018 that were mentioned by Dr. Marks included the a comment letter responding to BOEM's Outer Continental Shelf (OCS) Draft Proposed Program (DPP) for 2019-2024, and council endorsement of a report outlining suggestions and recommendations for how to manage invasive alga, *Undaria pinnatifida*. Dr. Marks also acknowledged that some council members participated in two sanctuary-led cleanups up on Santa Cruz Island, as well as other engagements by the council. Dr. Marks concluded her report by thanking the council for their attendance and passion. She also noted that she will be moving on to work with the National Marine Fishery Service on endangered white abalone restoration in southern California.

CINMS condition report and management plan revision process: status update, next steps, discussion of council's upcoming role

CINMS Deputy Superintendent Michael Murray began by discussing the expected completion of the condition report Volume 2 in May or early June of 2019. Murray noted

that Volume 1 of the condition report, which assesses the current condition of the sanctuary, is available on the CINMS website. The new condition report, which will combine Volumes 1 and 2, will be an update from the 2009 condition report, and will help inform updates to the next sanctuary management plan. Murray explained that Volume 1 describes the site history and resources, as well as economic and worldwide driving forces that add pressures to sanctuary resources. The main portion of Volume 1 is an assessment of the state of sanctuary resources, which was prepared with contributions of data and expertise from over 80 scientists, much of it coming from members of the council's research activities panel. Volume 2 will also contain an ecosystem services assessment, supported by a separately written report from the Chumash community to explain ecosystem-related values, and coordinated by council members Alicia Cordero and Luhui Isha. Finally, Murray explained that Vol. 2 of the Condition Report will contain a review of responses that CINMS has been part of to address the various pressures that the report documents.

Initial list of possible council work topics for 2019, and potential management plan scoping issues

Deputy Superintendent Murray began by sharing a few slides that summarize key findings from the sanctuary's Condition Report (Vol. 1), and noting how that kind of information can inform the process of revising the management plan. He reviewed the major sections of analysis and the ratings system used to evaluate the status and trends of sanctuary resources. He then explained the general process steps of the management plan review, and highlighted at which points and how the advisory council is anticipated to be most helpful. Council Chair Phyllis Grifman emphasized that the management plan review process will provide a very important opportunity for the council to get meaningfully involved, which can have really significant impacts on the future of the sanctuary. CINMS Superintendent Chris Mobley underscored the importance of collaboration between sanctuaries and partners to do the work it takes to manage the sanctuary, and emphasized how important it is for the council to be a part of the management plan revision so that the plan reflects their constituents' values, priorities, capacity, involvement, etc. Murray then asked council members to consider topics and activities they feel the advisory council should prioritize this year. He prepared a list of potential topics based on condition report findings as well as past areas of council interest, and asked members to use an individual worksheet to vote/rank these topics to help sanctuary staff to plan content for meetings in 2019, as well as to flag issues of concern or interest for evaluation during the sanctuary's upcoming management plan revision process.

Submit individual worksheets

It was decided by the council that a digital copy of the Topics of Interest Worksheet (described above) would be sent to council members, who would then have the opportunity to fill out the worksheet outside of the SAC meeting and submit them via email or regular mail.

Public Comment Period (#2 of 2)

No Comments

Working Group Reports

Council members shared updates on Working Groups and Subcommittee activities and plans

- *Chumash Community Working Group*. No report
- *Research Activities*. No report
- *Marketing Subcommittee*. Dr. Lindsay Marks, reporting on behalf of council member Michael Cohen, reported on upticks in CINMS social media interactions and the impacts of “sharing”. Take home: re-sharing content boosts outreach so please share CINMS social media posts on your own accounts. If you would like to receive notification when there are posts from CINMS that could be shared, send a request to Anna Jacobson at anna@sbadventureco.com.
- *Sanctuary Education Team*. Cliff Rodrigues gave a shout out to Island Packers for providing interpretive services to visitors during the government shutdown, and for helping with sanitation. He also announced that the SAC will be represented at CLU for the annual Ventura County Science Fair (3/22/19) to judge marine-related projects and to provide awards from CINMS for the winning students.
- *Recreational Fishing Working Group*. Merit McCrea stated that March is the biggest month of the year for this constituency. The Coastal Conservation Association is growing; Santa Barbara just got their first local chapter, and is able to bring together independent fishing clubs for fundraising and networking.
- *Commercial Fishing Working Group*. No Report
- *Conservation Working Group*. For the Santa Barbara Channel MPA Collaborative, Kristen Hislop has updated a booklet to educate boaters regarding *Undaria pinnatifida*. She also mentioned updates regarding a pilot brochure, “Fishing and MPAs”. The brochure will show pictures delineating MPA boundaries using compass headings. There is also an updated interactive map with interpretative features about the Santa Barbara Channel region MPAs. These updates moved away from expensive software to make this a more extensive ArcGIS-based story map. All products are soon to be released.

Meeting Close Out

- Council Chair Phyllis Grifman closed the meeting by thanking the council members and public for attending and thanking our hosts at the Ventura County Museum.
- Upcoming advisory council public meetings are scheduled for May 17, 2019 at the Santa Barbara Zoo, and July 19, 2019 in Oxnard at a location TBD.

Meeting adjourned

APPENDIX: Sanctuary Advisory Council Meeting Attendance Roster for March 15, 2019

Name	Advisory Council Seat	Attendance
Andrea Mills	Tourism	Present
Morgan Coffey	Tourism - Alternate	Present
Ben Pitterle	Non-Consumptive Recreation	Absent
Dr. Tony Knight	Non-Consumptive Recreation - Alternate	Present
Michael Cohen	Business	Absent
Capt. Kip Louttit	Business - Alternate	Present
Kristen Hislop	Conservation	Present
Greg Helms	Conservation - Alternate	Present
Stephanie Mutz	Commercial Fishing	Absent
John Hoadley	Commercial Fishing - Alternate	Absent
Capt. David Bacon	Recreational Fishing	Absent
Merit McCrea	Recreational Fishing - Alternate	Present
Cliff Rodrigues	Education	Present
<vacant>	Education - Alternate	n/a
Dr. Robert Warner	Research	Absent
Dr. Mark Steele	Research - Alternate	Present
Phyllis Grifman	Public at Large #1	Present
Judy Willens	Public at Large #1 - Alternate	Present
Richard Block	Public at Large #2	Absent
Mary Byrd	Public at Large #2 - Alternate	Present
Luhui Isha Ward	Chumash Community	Absent
Alicia Cordero	Chumash Community - Alternate	Absent
Laura McCue	NOAA Fisheries	Absent
<vacant>	NOAA Fisheries - Alternate	n/a
<vacant>	National Park Service	n/a
Ken Convery	National Park Service - Alternate	Absent
CDR Lushan Hannah	US Coast Guard	Absent
CDR Jason Brand	US Coast Guard - Alternate	Present
Donna Schroeder	Bureau of Ocean Energy Management	Present
Jeremy Potter	Bureau of Ocean Energy Mgmt. - Alternate	Absent
Walt Schobel	Dept. of Defense	Present
Greg Sanders	Dept. of Defense - Alternate	Present
Dr. Julia Coates	CA Dept. of Fish & Wildlife	Absent
John Ugoretz	CA Dept. of Fish & Wildlife - Alternate	Present
Jenn Eckerle	CA Natural Resources Agency	Absent
Paige Berube	CA Natural Resources Agency - Alternate	Absent
Dr. Jonna Engel	CA Coastal Commission	Present
Jacqueline Phelps	CA Coastal Commission - Alternate	Present
Errin Briggs	Santa Barbara County	Absent
David Villalobos	Santa Barbara County - Alternate	Present
Danielle Tarr	Ventura County	Absent
Mark Sandoval	Ventura County - Alternate	Present
Chris Mobley	Channel Islands NMS [non-voting]	Present
Mike Murray	Channel Islands NMS - Alternate [non-voting]	Present
Paul Michel	Monterey Bay NMS [non-voting]	Absent
Karen Grimmer	Monterey Bay NMS - Alternate [non-voting]	Absent
Maria Brown	Greater Farallones NMS [non-voting]	Absent
Brian Johnson	Greater Farallones NMS - Alternate [non-voting]	Absent

Total attendance: 23 council representatives, 16 voting seats.